

	Excluding GST					Traffic Management	Traffic Management	Crown Creek Piped	Crown Creek Bypass -
	Airly Creek	Coco Creek	Crown Creek	Total 3 Bridges (w/o traffic mgmt)	Normalised Score	Airly	Crown	bypass Track	Temporary Bridge
Central Industries - Revised Pricing	\$1,133,250	\$1,220,010	\$1,056,100	\$3,409,360	10.0	\$13,500	\$13,500	\$28,180	\$53,520
Central Industries - Original Pricing	\$1,136,400	\$1,227,300	\$1,062,400			\$13,500	\$13,500	-	-
Difference	-\$3,150	-\$7,290	-\$6,300						
Saunders Civilbuild - Revised Pricing	\$972,913	\$1,646,679	\$1,292,454	\$3,912,046	8.7	-	\$29,345	-	-
Saunders Civilbuild - Original Pricing (w/o footpath on Airly)	\$940,892	\$1,214,936	\$1,006,299			-	\$25,418	-	-
Difference	\$32,021	\$431,743	\$286,155						

Other evaluation considerations (using same weightings as original tender evaluation)

	Weighting (%)	Central Industries (Score out of 10)	Central Industries (Weighted Score)		Saunders Civilbuild (Score out of 10)		
Proposed methodology & program	30	8	240	<p>Central Industries propose a Rocla modular construction which will save time during construction (2 month turnaround per bridge).</p> <p>They have noted inclusion of a footpath at all sites, 9.6m wide with 7.5m wide roadway (3.75m lanes)</p> <p>TL4 Steel barriers to be used on side of roadway with BR20 railing to be used on edge of footpath. Optional concrete barrier can be installed between footpath and roadway instead which will add to cost.</p> <p>Higher score given due to shorter turnaround time and inclusion of footpath at Airly</p>	7	210	<p>Saunders Civilbuild have proposed a methodology where abutments, wingwalls and headstocks are precast, while columns are poured in-situ (3 month turnaround per bridge)</p> <p>Footpath included at Coco and Crown Creek bridges but eastern approach at Airly bridge will not allow, based on minimum design width, 9.8m wide.</p> <p>As a result, bridges at Coco and Crown will accommodate 9.8m width, 7.2m roadway (3.6m lanes).</p> <p>Airly Creek design proposed is 7.2m wide</p>
Demonstrated experience & past performance	10	8	80	<p>Central Industries has only constructed pedestrian bridges in the past and is currently undertaking their first construction of a roadbridge for Walgett Shire Council. They are however utilising subcontractors that have had bridge construction experience. Rocla is supplying the precast bridge material, which has been used in many applications and Calare Civil are drafting engineering specs. Rocla and Calare have recently worked together on a subdivision bridge project in Little Hartley.</p>	10	100	<p>Saunders Civilbuild has had extensive experience in bridge building, having undertaken bridge demolition / construction projects for multiple NSW Councils.</p> <p>A reference check on a NSW Council that has had multiple bridges replaced by Saunders Civilbuild revealed a high level of satisfaction with their work.</p> <p>Due to Saunders Civilbuild's extensive experience in bridge-building, they have been ranked slightly higher than Central Industries.</p>
Capability & capacity of key personnel	10	9	90	<p>Central Industries has worked with Council on multiple projects in recent years and have proven to be reliable and competent.</p> <p>The subcontractors proposed to be utilised have experience in providing bridge construction materials, completing detailed designs and undertaking civil works. These include Rocla, Calare Civil, Millent Civil, Henry Crane Hire, Hanson Concrete, Bagatella Bitumen</p>	9	90	<p>Saunders Civilbuild's staff appear to have many years experience in bridge / civil construction.</p> <p>They only propose to engage subcontractors for the design component, Andes Engineering and Bridge Design Pty Ltd</p>

Local Preference	5	10	50	Based permanently in the Lithgow Local Government Area, Central Industries meets the criteria of Council's Local Preference Policy	0	0	Saunders Civilbuild are located in the Newcastle area, outside of the Lithgow LGA
Innovation & Circular Economy	5	10	50	Central Industries will provide the timber from the removed bridges to an organisation called 'Living Timber' in Penrith. This organisation repurposes the timber to turn it into furniture and other items. Living Timber pays around \$600 per cubic metre and Central Industries has pledged to keep and open book and donate the revenue back to the community in the form of projects.	5	25	Saunders Civilbuild has advised that they will be utilising demolition contractors which will pass the timber onto timber recyclers.
Pricing (see details above)	40	10	400	Details at top of spreadsheet	8.7	348	Details at top of spreadsheet

910

773

TOTAL SCORE (out of 100)

91

77